

Date: 3/8/2021
 To: Berta Heybey, Managing Director Monitoring and Evaluation
 From: Cindy Sobieski, Evaluation Lead (Transport) and Jack Molyneux, Evaluation Lead (Transport)
 CC: Shreena Patel, Senior Director Evaluation

RE: Cancellation Memo for multiple Roads Evaluations

This memo describes MCC’s decisions to cancel and rebid four independent evaluations of MCC road investments in Ghana, Senegal, and Tanzania. These decisions were taken from 2013 to 2016 to address weaknesses in either contractor performance or evaluation design and to better balance cost and the potential for learning in the ways outlined in the *Lessons from MCC’s Investments in Roads Principles into Practice* paper. Each of these evaluations was re-competed and taken over by another evaluator.

Overview of Evaluations

MCC and/or the Millennium Challenge Account’s (MCA) M&E team contracted the evaluators listed below to lead the independent evaluation of the listed investments.

Country	Evaluator	Contracted Date	Project/Activity	Evaluation Cost (\$)	Years
Ghana	NORC (MCA-Contracted)	3/30/2009	Feeder Roads Activity	\$373,488.00	2009-12
Senegal	IMPAQ	1/03/2011	Construction, Supervision and Project Management Activity	\$221,854.82	2012-15
Tanzania	Abel Buselema (MCA-Contracted)	2012	Mafia Island Airport Activity	\$98,954.00	2012-13
Tanzania	Economic Development Initiatives (EDI) (MCA-Contracted) and NORC	9/30/2011	Mainland Trunk Roads Activity Zanzibar Rural Roads Activity Road Maintenance Activity	EDI: \$796, 945.00 NORC: \$439,151.84	2012-14

Description of the Risk(s)/Risk(s) Mitigation

In 2013, MCC M&E undertook an in-depth peer review of six early roads evaluations to assess their success in producing meaningful results to support accountability and learning in the transport sector.

Lessons from the peer review coupled with a broader review of MCC's roads investments and evaluations, conducted from 2014-6, culminated in the Principles into Practice Paper, [Lessons from MCC's Investments in Roads](#). This paper proposed a new set of standard road evaluation to better balance cost and the potential for learning when designing road project evaluations. Accordingly, the scope and methodology of MCC road evaluations that had not yet completed the final evaluation stage were reviewed and five existing evaluations were ultimately canceled and re-bid to align with the new evaluation approach (Ghana, Senegal, Burkina Faso, and two Tanzania roads evaluations). In addition to the rationale provided above, the following risks contributed to the cancellation of the respective evaluations. Note that the specifics around the cancellation of the Burkina Faso roads evaluation is the subject of another memo.

- Ghana Feeder Roads Evaluation: There was weak evidence for expected impacts on prices (the original design hypothesis), leading MCC to reconsider the evaluation strategy.
- Senegal Roads Evaluation: There were performance issues and quality concerns with the evaluator, leading to MCC canceling the evaluation.
- Tanzania – Mafia Island Airport Evaluation: MCC decided to re-bid both the Roads and Airport Evaluations into one Transportation contract given previous evaluator performance and quality concerns and an objective to have the evaluation consider the full Transport Project through one evaluation.
- Tanzania – Mainland Trunk and Zanzibar Rural Roads Evaluation: This evaluation was originally contracted to EDI by MCA-Tanzania and EDI designed the evaluation and conducted a baseline study. EDI was not contracted to conduct further evaluation work, so MCC later hired NORC as the independent evaluator to continue the evaluation. Both NORC and MCC had concerns regarding the original evaluation design and could not agree on the best way to re-design the evaluation.

Relevant Evaluation Materials

Evaluation materials that were completed and published by MCC prior to the cancellation of the evaluations are available at the following links:

- [Ghana Feeder Roads Evaluation](#) – note that the design of the NORC evaluation is covered in the Evaluator Inception Report.
- [Senegal Roads Evaluation](#)
- [Tanzania – Mafia Island Airport Evaluation](#)
- [Tanzania – Mainland Trunk and Zanzibar Rural Roads Evaluation](#) – note that only the EDI deliverables are published because MCC did not approve an Evaluation Design Report to be published under the NORC contract. The design of the original EDI evaluation is described in the baseline report.



MILLENNIUM
CHALLENGE CORPORATION
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Evaluation materials related to the newly awarded evaluations are available through the following links:

- [Ghana Transportation Evaluation](#)
- [Senegal Roads Evaluation](#)
- [Tanzania Transport Sector Evaluation](#)

Approved M&E MD
03/08/2021